# *p*-WAVE SUPERCONDUCTIVITY FROM VALLEY SYMMETRY BREAKING IN TWISTED TRILAYER GRAPHENE



J. González<sup>1</sup> and T. Stauber<sup>2</sup> <sup>1</sup>Instituto de Estructura de la Materia, CSIC, Spain <sup>2</sup>Instituto de Ciencia de Materiales de Madrid, CSIC, Spain

Recently there have been consistent observations of superconductivity in twisted graphene trilayers, quadrilayers, pentalayers (in setups with alternating twist angle  $\theta$ ,  $-\theta$ ,  $\theta$ ,  $-\theta$  ...), specially in the hole-doped regime for filling fraction  $\nu < -2$ 



- J. M. Park, Y. Cao, K. Watanabe, T. Taniguchi, and P. Jarillo-Herrero, Nature 590, 249 (2021)
- > Z. Hao *et al.*, Science 371, 1133 (2021)
- > J. M. Park *et al.*, Nature 595, 526 (2021)
- > Y. Zhang *et al.*, arXiv:2112.09270
- > J. M. Park *et al.*, arXiv:2112.10760

In the case of twisted trilayer graphene, it can be shown that many of the experimental observations are the consequence of the spontaneous breakdown of the valley symmetry. This induces spin-valley locking, with important consequences for the superconductivity



We study the dynamical symmetry breaking by means of a self-consistent Hartree-Fock approximation in real space, starting from a tight-binding approach.

The noninteracting Hamiltonian  $H_0$  can be represented in the form

$$H_{0} = -\sum_{n=1}^{5} t_{\parallel} (\mathbf{r}_{i} - \mathbf{r}_{j}) (a_{n,i}^{+} a_{n,j} + \text{h.c.}) - \sum_{n \neq m} t_{\perp} (\mathbf{r}_{i} - \mathbf{r}_{j}) (a_{n,i}^{+} a_{m,j} + \text{h.c.})$$

In the case of twisted trilayer graphene with alternating twist angle, approximately flat bands are found for  $\theta \approx 1.6^{\circ}$  (taking also into account out-of-plane relaxation)



For the interacting part of the Hamiltonian  $H_{int}$ , we include both extended Coulomb (screened by metallic gates) and Hubbard contributions

$$H_{\text{int}} = H_C + H_U$$

$$H_C = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i,j,\sigma,\sigma'} a_{i\sigma}^{\dagger} a_{i\sigma} v_C (\mathbf{r}_i - \mathbf{r}_j) a_{j\sigma'}^{\dagger} a_{j\sigma'} v_C (\mathbf{r}) = \frac{e^2}{4\pi\varepsilon} 2\sqrt{2} \frac{e^{-\pi t/\xi}}{\xi \sqrt{r/\xi}}$$

$$H_U = U \sum_i a_{i\uparrow}^{\dagger} a_{i\uparrow} a_{i\downarrow}^{\dagger} a_{i\downarrow}$$

The noninteracting Hamiltonian  $H_0$  can be written in terms of the eigenvalues and eigenvectors of the large tight-binding matrix

The noninteracting electron propagator  $G_0$  becomes the inverse of  $H_0$  in the zero-frequency (static) limit

The Hartree-Fock approximation proceeds by assuming that the full electron propagator *G* has a similar representation

$$(H_0)_{i\sigma,j\sigma} = \sum_a \varepsilon_{a\sigma}^{(0)} \phi_{a\sigma}^{(0)}(\mathbf{r}_i) \phi_{a\sigma}^{(0)}(\mathbf{r}_j)$$

$$\left(G_{0}\right)_{i\sigma,j\sigma} = -\sum_{a} \frac{1}{\varepsilon_{a\sigma}^{(0)}} \phi_{a\sigma}^{(0)}(\mathbf{r}_{i}) \phi_{a\sigma}^{(0)}(\mathbf{r}_{j})^{*}$$

$$(G)_{i\sigma,j\sigma} = -\sum_{a} \frac{1}{\varepsilon_{a\sigma}} \phi_{a\sigma}(\mathbf{r}_{i}) \phi_{a\sigma}(\mathbf{r}_{j})^{*}$$

The eigenvectors  $\phi$  are obtained by solving self-consistently the Dyson equation

$$G^{-1} = G_0^{-1} - \Sigma$$

with the electron self-energy  $\Sigma$ 

$$\left(\Sigma\right)_{i\sigma,j\sigma} = 2\mathbf{1}_{ij} \sum_{\substack{\text{filled}\\\text{bands}}} \sum_{l\sigma'} v_{\sigma\sigma'}(\mathbf{r}_i - \mathbf{r}_l) \left|\phi_{a\sigma'}(\mathbf{r}_l)\right|^2$$

$$-v_{\sigma\sigma}(\mathbf{r}_{i}-\mathbf{r}_{j})\sum_{\substack{\text{filled}\\\text{bands}}}\phi_{a\sigma}(\mathbf{r}_{i})\phi_{a\sigma}(\mathbf{r}_{j})^{*}$$

The condensation of different order parameters can be studied through the matrix elements  $h_{ii}$ 

The patterns of symmetry breaking which arise in twisted trilayer graphene are:

- chiral symmetry breaking characterized by staggered charge order in sublattices *A* and *B*
- time-reversal symmetry breaking with currents circulating along nearest neighbors i<sub>1</sub>, i<sub>2</sub>, i<sub>3</sub> of each site

2-hole doping





$$C^{(\sigma)} = \sum_{i \in A} h_{ii}^{(\sigma)} - \sum_{i \in B} h_{ii}^{(\sigma)}$$
$$^{\sigma)} = \operatorname{Im}\left(\sum_{i \in A} \left(h_{i_1 i_2}^{(\sigma)} h_{i_2 i_3}^{(\sigma)} h_{i_3 i_1}^{(\sigma)}\right)^{1/3} \pm \sum_{i \in B} \left(h_{i_1 i_2}^{(\sigma)} h_{i_2 i_3}^{(\sigma)} h_{i_3 i_1}^{(\sigma)}\right)^{1/3}\right)$$



The dominant order parameter corresponds to valley symmetry breaking with  $P_{-} \neq 0$ 

 $P_{\perp}^{(}$ 

The spontaneous breakdown of valley symmetry has important consequences, since at v = -2 it places the Fermi level between the first and the second valence band, where a sufficiently strong interaction can open a gap



The gap between the first two valence bands has an interesting experimental signature, which is the reset of the Hall density at v = -2.

Our estimates from the self-consistent Hartree-Fock approach lead to good agreement with the experimental observations of the Hall density



The other important consequence of valley symmetry breaking is the reduction of symmetry from  $C_6$  to  $C_3$ , since this latter group is the one operating in a single graphene valley.

We can observe the reduction of symmetry in the plot of the second valence band in the Brillouin zone, for different values of the filling fraction



There is then an increase in the anisotropy of the bands, with the consequent amplification of the modulations of the *e-e* scattering along the Fermi line. This makes the system very prone to a Kohn-Luttinger (superconducting) instability.



The self-consistent Hartree-Fock approach leads actually to a solution where the two spin projections have opposite sign of the valley symmetry breaking (i.e. with exchange of the two valleys)

There is then spin-valley locking in twisted trilayer graphene, which opens the possibility of having a (so-called) Ising superconductivity. The pairing of electrons takes place with each spin projection attached to a different valley of the trilayer.

This protects the superconductivity against magnetic fields, since there is a gap between the bands for the two spin projections at each valley



When we have a highly anisotropic Fermi surface, electronic instabilities may arise. Focusing on superconductivity, we have to look at the divergences in the Cooper-pair (BCS) channel

$$\begin{array}{c} \mathbf{p} \uparrow \\ \mathbf{-p} \downarrow \end{array} \begin{pmatrix} \uparrow \mathbf{k} \\ \downarrow -\mathbf{k} \end{array} = \begin{array}{c} \mathbf{p} \uparrow \\ -\mathbf{p} \downarrow \end{array} \begin{pmatrix} \uparrow \mathbf{k} \\ \downarrow -\mathbf{k} \end{array} + \begin{array}{c} \mathbf{p} \uparrow \\ -\mathbf{p} \downarrow \end{array} \begin{pmatrix} \uparrow \mathbf{k} \\ -\mathbf{p} \downarrow \end{array}$$

$$V(\theta, \theta'; \omega) = V_0(\theta, \theta') - \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^\Lambda d\varepsilon \int_0^{2\pi} d\theta'' \frac{\partial k_\perp}{\partial \varepsilon} \frac{\partial k_\parallel}{\partial \theta''} V_0(\theta, \theta'') \frac{1}{\varepsilon - \frac{\omega}{2}} V(\theta'', \theta'; \omega)$$

The self-consistent equation of the BCS vertex can be simplified by reabsorbing the density of states

$$\widehat{V}(\theta, \theta'; \omega) = \sqrt{\frac{1}{2\pi}} \frac{\partial k_{\perp}(\theta)}{\partial \varepsilon} \frac{\partial k_{\parallel}(\theta)}{\partial \theta} \sqrt{\frac{1}{2\pi}} \frac{\partial k_{\perp}(\theta')}{\partial \varepsilon} \frac{\partial k_{\parallel}(\theta')}{\partial \theta'} V(\theta, \theta'; \omega)$$

Taking the derivative with respect to the cutoff  $\Lambda$ , we arrive at

$$\Lambda \frac{\partial}{\partial \Lambda} \hat{V}(\theta, \theta') = \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} d\theta'' \hat{V}(\theta, \theta'') \hat{V}(\theta'', \theta')$$

This equation has a divergent flow when any of the harmonics has a coefficient  $\hat{V}_n < 0$ , with

$$\hat{V}_n(\omega) \approx \frac{\hat{V}_n(\Lambda)}{1 + \hat{V}_n(\Lambda) \log\left(\frac{\Lambda}{\omega}\right)}$$

which leads to the signature of the pairing instability in the low-energy limit  $\omega \rightarrow 0$ .

In twisted trilayer graphene, we may have a pairing instability as the scattering of the electrons in a Cooper pair has a very strong modulation along the anisotropic Fermi line

The bare BCS vertex at the high-energy cutoff can be expressed as a sum of particle-hole contributions (in terms of the particle-hole susceptibility  $\chi_a$ )

The expansion of  $\hat{V}_0(\theta, \theta')$  can be grouped in terms of irreduci  $A_1 \longrightarrow \{\cos(3n\theta)\}, A_2 \longrightarrow \{\sin(3n\theta)\}, E \longrightarrow \{\cos(m\theta), \sin(m\theta)\}$ 

The solution of the scaling equation

$$\hat{V}_n(\omega) \approx \frac{\hat{V}_n(\Lambda)}{1 + \hat{V}_n(\Lambda) \log\left(\frac{\Lambda}{\omega}\right)}$$

leads to a pairing instability at the energy scale

$$\omega_c = \Lambda \exp\left(-1/\left|\hat{V}_n(\Lambda)\right|\right)$$

which is consistent with a critical temperature of  $\sim 1$  K.

Eigenvalue $\lambda$	harmonics	Irr. Rep.
$0.75 \\ 0.73$	$\{\cos(2\phi),\sin(2\phi)\}$	Е
$0.35 \\ 0.32$	$\{\cos(4\phi),\sin(4\phi)\}$	Е
-0.23 -0.22	$\{\cos(\phi),\sin(\phi)\}$	Е
0.21	$\cos(6\phi)$	$A_1$
0.17	$\sin(6\phi)$	$A_2$
-0.15	$\cos(3\phi)$	$A_1$

Eigenvalue 
$$\lambda$$
harmonicsIrr. Rep. $0.75$ { $\cos(2\phi), \sin(2\phi)$ }E $0.35$ { $\cos(4\phi), \sin(4\phi)$ }E

$$V_0(\phi, \phi') = U + \frac{U^2 \chi_{k+k'}}{1 - U \chi_{k+k'}} + \frac{U^3 \chi_{k-k'}^2}{1 - U^2 \chi_{k-k'}^2}$$

In conclusion,

we have seen that the valley symmetry is spontaneously broken in twisted trilayer graphene, in the hole-doped regime relevant for superconductivity



the breakdown of valley symmetry leads to spin-valley locking, by which the two spin projections are energetically favored at opposite *K* points of the Brillouin zone



the anisotropy in the dispersion of the second valence band gives rise to a strong modulation of the *e-e* scattering along the Fermi line, promoting a Kohn-Luttinger instability at a critical temperature consistent with the experimental observations